during the 2007-2008 election cycle. Ward did not disclose these transactions on the

39

FEDERAL ELECTION COMMISSION

23

Committee's disclosure reports, which he prepared and filed with the Commission. The failure 1 2 to disclose these transactions resulted in the misreporting of the Committee's cash-on-hand, receipts, and disbursements. 3 According to information contained in the referral, Ward concealed his misappropriations 4 and reporting omissions, which were not discovered until the Committee conducted an internal 5 review of its bank records following media reports of the National Republican Congressional Channitten's ("NRCC") causerns with Ward's sativities as its treasums. It appears that Ward's 7 activities in these matters may be part of an overarching emissival ement scheme devised by Wast. See Pre-MUR 470/RR 08L-22 (NRCC), First General Counsel's Report, dated September 10, 2008; Pre-MURs 465, 466, 467 and 468 (Tuesday Group PAC, et al.), First General Counsel's 10 11 Report, dated September 10, 2008; Pre-MUR 471/RR 08L-26/MUR 6017 (PhilPAC), First General Counsel's Report, dated October 9, 2008; and Pre-MUR 476/RR 08L-27/MUR 6063 12 (SAXPAC), First General Counsel's Report, dated October 17, 2008. 13 By letter dated November 20, 2008, we gave Ward, through counsel, the opportunity to 14 provide us with any factual or legal information he believes relevant to this matter. To date, we 15 have not received a response from Ward, and, based on conversations with his counsel that Ward 16 will not be providing information because he is the target of a pending penaltel crimination 17 investigation, we do not anticipate that a response will be filed on his behalf. 12 19 20 21

We further recommend that the Commission find reason to believe that

- 1 Christopher J. Ward, in his personal capacity, knowingly and willfully violated 2 U.S.C.
- 2 §§ 432(b)(3), (c), (d) and 434(b) and 11 C.F.R. § 104.14(d), by comminging committee funds with
- 3 his personal funds, failing to keep account of and disclose cash-on-hand, receipts, and disbursements
- 4 on reports filed with the Commission, and failing to file timely, complete and accurate reports. Last.
- 5 we recommend that the Commission authorize the use of compulsory process to obtain additional
- 6 information regarding Ward's embezzlement scheme and the resulting reporting and recordkeeping
- 7 omissions.

## II. <u>FACTUAL SUMMARY</u>

- 9. LUISPAC is a multicandidate political committee and has been filing reports with the
- 10 Commission since 2004. 2 U.S.C. § 441a(a)(4). According to disclosure reports filed with the
- 11 Commission, Ward served as LUISPAC's treasurer since the Committee's inception in February
- 12 2004, until he was replaced by Ms. Sanchez Bras on February 20, 2008.
- On June 20, 2008, the Committee filed five amended reports for the 2007-2008 election
- cycle disclosing four disbursements to Ward in the total amount of \$40,000, a \$1,000
- 15 disbursement to Safeguarding America by Expanding National Security Political Action
- 16 Committee ("SAXPAC"), and a \$23,500 receipt from Ward. Specifically, the amended reports
- 17 identified each of the following transactions as "unauthorized dishamements": Amended 2007
- 18 May Manthly Report \$20,000 to Ward on April 9, 2607; Amended 2007 August Monthly
- 19 Report -- \$10,000 to Ward on July 24, 2007; and 2007 September Monthly Report -- \$5,000 to
- 20 Ward on August 17, 2007 and \$5,000 to Ward on August 24, 2007. The Amended 2008
- 21 February Monthly Report disclosed an "unauthorized political contribution" in the amount of
- 22 \$1,000 on January 3, 2008 to SAXPAC. Last, the Amended 2008 March Monthly Report

- disclosed a \$23,500 receipt from Ward on February 8, 2008 with the purpose identified as
- 2 "refund unauthorized disbursement."
- On July 11, 2008, after reviewing the amended reports, RAD contacted LUISPAC's
- 4 current treasurer, Ms. Sanchez Bras, to inquire about the recently disclosed unauthorized activity.
- 5 As further described in the referral, Ms. Sanchez Bras recounted to the RAD analyst that Rep.
- 6 Luis Fortuno, the House member for Puerto Rico, had contacted her after learning of Ward's
- 7 alleged embezzlement activities with the NRCC and saked her to replace Ward as treasurer. Ms.
- 8 Sanchen Bras said that the Committee hised an outside firm to audit the Committee's activities,
- 9 and, in June 2008, following completion of the audit, the firm amended the Committee's reports
- to disclose the financial activity accurately. To her knowledge, the unauthorized activity took
- place as reported on the amended reports. According to Ms. Sanchez Bras, Ward wrote the
- 12 checks to himself, but the Committee did not keep copies of the checks and is working with its
- bank to obtain copies. Although the exact time frame is unknown, the Committee has been
- 14 working with the FBI in Washington, DC about Ward's unauthorized transactions in this matter.
- 15 There is no available information to determine whether LUISPAC had any internal financial
- 16 controls in place prior to its discovery of Ward's embezzlement of Rands. However, the
- information contained in the RAD Referral suggests that LUISPAC may have lacked internal
- 18 controls, given that Ward's embendament want undetexted for mostly and may have continued.
- 19 were it not for the media reports surrounding the NRCC's concerns with Ward, which prompted
- 20 LUISPAC to conduct an internal audit.

## 1 III. <u>LEGAL ANALYSIS</u>



According to Commission policy and practice, a former treasurer may be named as a respondent in his personal capacity when it appears that, while serving as a treasurer, he may have violated obligations that the Act or Commission regulations impose personally on a

- 1 treasurer and where, among other situations, the violations were knowing and willful. See
- 2 Statement of Policy Regarding Treasurers Subject to Enforcement Proceedings. 70 Fed. Reg. 3
- 3 (January 3, 2005); see, e.g., MUR 5610 (Barl Allen Haywood), MUR 5721 (Lockheed Martin
- 4 Employees' PAC) and MUR 5971 (Lindsey Graham for Senate). A knowing and willful
- 5 violation may be established "by proof that the defendant acted deliberately and with knowledge"
- 6 that an action was unlawful. United States v. Hopkins, 916 F.2d 207, 214 (5th Cir. 1996). In
- 7 Hopkins, the court found that an inference of a knowing and willful violation could be drawn
- 8 "from the defendants' elaborate scheme for diagnizing their . . . political contributions . . ." Id. at
- 9 214-15. The court also found that the evidence did not have to show that a defendant "had
- 10 specific knowledge of the regulations" or "conclusively demonstrate" a defendant's "state of
- 11 mind," if there were "facts and circumstances from which the jury reasonably could infer that
- 12 [the defendant] knew her conduct was unauthorized and illegal." Id. at 213 (quoting United
- 13 States v. Bordelon, 871 F.2d 491, 494 (5th Cir.), cert. denied, 493 U.S. 838 (1989)).
- The available information suggests that Ward attempted to disguise his embezzlement by
- 15 not disclosing the unauthorized disbursements and receipts in Committee reports he prepared and
- then filed with the Commission. RR 08L-30, at 2. Therefore, we recommend that the
- 17 Commission make knowing and willful findings at to Ward in his presonal capacity in
- 18 connection with violations of the Act and Commission regulations while performing the duties of
- 19 treasurer of LLJISPAC.
- 20 As treasurer, Ward was required to accurately keep an account of and disclose, cash-on-
- 21 hand, receipts and disbursements. See 2 U.S.C. §§ 432(c)(5), (d), 434(b)(1), (2), (3), (4)(H), (5)
- and (6)(B) and 11 C.F.R. § 104.3(a), (b). Committee treasurers required to file any report or
- 23 statement under the Act and the Commission's regulations are also personally responsible for the

1	timely and complete filing of the report or statement and for the accuracy of any information or
2	statement contained in it. 11 C.F.R. § 104.14(d). It appears Ward knowingly and willfully failed
3	to keep an accurate account of all receipts, disbursements and cash-on-hand with respect to his
4	activities as treasurer of LUISPAC to hide his fraudulent scheme and failed to accurately disclose
5	certain receipts, disbursements and cash-on-hand in reports filed with the Commission.
6	The Act also prohibits the commingling of committee funds with the "personal funds of
7	any individual," including officers of a consmitten. 2 U.S.C. § 432(b)(3) and 11 C.F.R. § 102.15.
8	The Commission has previously made findings that respondents have violated 2 U.S.C.
9	§ 432(b)(3) in matters where individuals misappropriated committee funds by making
10	unauthorized disbursements to themselves or others to pay for personal expenses. See, e.g.,
11	MUR 5610 (Dole), MUR 5721 (Lockheed Martin Employees PAC), MUR 5811 (Dogett for
12	Congress), MUR 5814 (Lamutt for Congress), MUR 5872 (Hague for Congress), MUR 5920
13	(Women's Campaign Fund), and MUR 5971 (Lindsey Graham for Senate). But see, e.g., MUR
14	5898 (Ryan Pennington) (The Commission voted 3-3 not to accept the negotiated conciliation
15	agreement with the embezzler, which included an admission to knowingly and willfully violating
16	2 U.S.C. § 432(b)(3), where the embezzler deposited committee funds to his personal account
17	from a third-panty intermediany ancount with a separate hegal existence);
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	

and MUR 5933 (Kimberly

- 2 Bostic) (by a 3-3 vote, the Commission failed to approve recommendations to pursue pre-
- 3 probable cause to believe conciliation with the embezzler for a commingling violation, where the
- 4 embezzler, without authorization, charged personal expenses to the Committee's bank account
- 5 through an unauthorized credit card).

Based on the available information, Ward knowingly and willfully misappropriated committee finals by writing frimsaif checks from LUISPAC's bank account without authorization. Given the information in the referral stating that the checks were made out to Ward personally, it appears that Ward either cashed the checks or deposited them into his personal bank account. In addition, given that we do not know the source of funds used to make Ward's unauthorized deposit of \$23,500, questions remain as to whether Ward took funds embezzled from another committee, placed them in his personal bank account, and then deposited them into LUISPAC's bank account.

Accordingly, we recommend that the Commission find reason to believe that Christopher J. Ward, in his official capacity as treasurer of LUISPAC and in his personal capacity, knowingly and willfully violated 2 U.S.C. §§ 432(b)(3), (c), (d), 434(b) and 11 C.F.R. § 104.14(d) by commissing committee funds with his personal funds, failing to keep secount of and disclose reasipts, distressements and cash-on-hand in reports filed with the Commission, and failing to file timely, complete and accurate reports with the Commission.

Ward is also a respondent in Pre-MUR 470/08L-22 (NRCC), Pre-MURs 465, 466, 467, 468 (Tuesday Group PAC, et al.), RR 08L-26/Pre-MUR 471/MUR 6017(PhilPAC), and RR 08L-27/Pre-MUR 476/MUR 6063(SAXPAC). The First General Counsel's Reports in these matters were circulated to the Commission on October 14 and 20, 2008.

## IV. PROPOSED INVESTIGATION

2	We do not have sufficient information from the RAD Referral to allow the Commission
3	to proceed directly to pre-probable cause conciliation. While the amount in violation in this
4	matter appears at this time to be relatively low, we recommend going forward with an
5	investigation because it is not clear how, if at all, Ward's various embezzlements are interrelated.
6	The embezzlement may be intertwined with an overarching embezzlement scheme devised by
7	Ward. Because at tilis pulint we do not know the fall extent of Wird's embezalisment scheme, we
8	cannot be certain of the full amount in violation in this matter. An investigation of Ward in
9	connection with this matter and Pre-MUR 470/RR 08L-22 involving the NRCC, Pre-MURs 465,
10	466, 467 and 468 involving four leadership PACs, Pre-MUR 471/RR 08L-26/MUR 6017
11	involving PhilPAC, and RR 08L-27/Pre-MUR 476/MUR 6063 involving SAXPAC may reveal
12	that he made further unauthorized transactions from these committees that have not yet been
13	discovered. In addition, although the Committee amended its 2008 March Monthly Report to
14	disclose a \$23,500 receipt by Ward on February 8, 2008 and designated it as a refund of
15	unauthorized disbursements, there are insufficient facts to establish the source of the funds.
16	
17	7
18	
19	,
20	Therefore, we recommend that the Commission authorize the use of compulsory process.
21	
22	
23	

2.

l

- Find reason to believe Christopher J. Ward in his personal capacity knowingly and willfully violated 2 U.S.C. §§ 432(b)(3), (c), (d), 434(b), and 11 C.F.R. § 104.14(d).
  - 4. Approve the attached Factual and Legal Analyses.

16 17

18

. 23

24 25

26 5. Authorize the use of compulsory process in this matter, including the issuance of interrogatories, document subpoenas, deposition subpoenas and orders.

	1 2	6.	Approve the appropriate letters.	
11044290540	3 4 5			Thomasenia P. Duncan General Counsel
	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Date Date	BY:	Ann Marie Terzaken  Associate General Counsel for Enforcement  Sidney Rocke  Assistant General Counsel  Chutture Challagher  Christine C. Gallagher
	20 21 22 23			Attorney